

149 Woods Hole Road  
Woods Hole MA 02540

February 22, 2016

Dear Majority Leader Mitch McConnell, Minority Leader Harry Reid, Chairwoman Lisa Murkowski, and Ranking Member Maria Cantwell:

We are 65 research scientists and practitioners who study energy, soils, forested and wetland ecosystems and climate change. We are writing in our individual capacities to express our concern over the implications of a “forest biomass carbon neutrality” Senate Amendment 3140 to the Energy Policy Modernization Act that was recently accepted by the US Senate.

This well-intentioned legislation, which claims to address climate change, would in fact promote deforestation in the U.S. and elsewhere and make climate change much worse.

The amendment would require all federal departments and agencies to promote consistent policies that “reflect the carbon neutrality of forest bioenergy and recognize biomass as a renewable energy source.” Mandating that there are no carbon dioxide emissions from burning wood from forests to produce energy does not make it so in fact.

The consequence of the amendment is to encourage a shift to forest biofuels in the form of pellets and wood chips to replace coal in the generation of electricity. Wood burning power plants are becoming more numerous in the United States and in the European Union. The US Department of Commerce and the US Forest Service are promoting expanded export of American wood pellets for this purpose to Europe and to Asia.

Burning any carbon containing substance whether biomass or fossil fuels releases carbon dioxide into the atmosphere. Burning forest biomass to make electricity releases substantially more carbon dioxide per unit of electricity than does coal. Removing the carbon dioxide released from burning wood through new tree growth requires many decades to a century, and not all trees reach maturity because of drought, fire, insects or land use conversion. All the while the added carbon dioxide is in the atmosphere trapping heat. Right now, large areas of American forests including old growth trees are being cleared for pellets that are shipped to Europe and burned to produce electricity that is counted there as zero carbon. There is no requirement in the amendment that trees used for bioenergy be replaced. International obligations require the United States to account for bioenergy emissions from either the energy sector or as land-use change.

While forest biomass energy may be renewable over the long-term, it is not a low-carbon source of energy like solar panels. Using the same amount of land area, solar panels produce up to 80-times as much electricity as wood burning with no emissions at all. Yet with this amendment, both might receive the same subsidy under the Act. Furthermore, fossil fuel emissions associated with producing bioenergy (harvesting, chipping, drying, pelletizing and transporting) are equivalent to 20-25% of direct emissions, and under this legislation these emissions are unaccounted for.

Forest bioenergy as currently produced also competes with land for other forest products including timber, paper and agriculture. Promoting forest biomass therefore encourages additional deforestation.

Granting carbon amnesty to forest biomass burning for energy could lead to significant depletion of US forests. The potential implications of declaring carbon neutrality for forest biofuels are great because even small quantities of bioenergy require large quantities of wood. The US Energy Information Agency estimates that for each 1% added to current US electricity production from forest biomass an additional 18% increase in US forest harvest is required. This policy would also encourage the destruction of forests in developing countries that would see the US as an export market. This would undermine international attempts to protect tropical forests in these countries through the programs agreed to in Paris.

This amendment puts forest carbon in the atmosphere contributing to climate change instead of keeping it in living, productive forests that provide multiple benefits of water and wetland protection, flood control, soils protection, wildlife habitat, improved air quality and recreational benefits for hunters and all who enjoy being in the great out-of-doors.

Legislating scientific facts is never a good idea, but is especially bad when the “facts” are incorrect. We urge you and other members of the Senate to reconsider this well-intentioned legislation and eliminate the misrepresentation that forest bioenergy is carbon-neutral.

We respectfully request an opportunity to inform you and other Senators of the scientific evidence for the appropriate accounting of forest bioenergy emissions. You could perform a great service by proposing and enacting legislation that effectively addresses climate change by enhancing the capacity of forests to reduce the amount of carbon dioxide entering the atmosphere. Any number of us would be willing to testify or to assist you and your staff in meeting the climate challenge with scientifically sound actions.

Sincerely,

Philip B. Duffy, Ph.D. President and Executive Director Woods Hole Research Center  
[pduffy@whrc.org](mailto:pduffy@whrc.org) 508-444-1504

Prof. Emeritus William R. Moomaw, Ph.D., Co-Director Global Development and Environment Institute, Tufts University [william.moomaw@tufts.edu](mailto:william.moomaw@tufts.edu) 617-335-3994

William Schlesinger, Ph.D., President Emeritus, Cary Institute [schlesingerw@caryinstitute.org](mailto:schlesingerw@caryinstitute.org)

cc Olivia Kurtz, Senator Collins' Energy legislative Council, James Springer, Senator King's Energy legislative Council, Anne Knapke, Senator Klobuchar's Energy legislative Council and Blaise Sheriden, Senator Franken's Legislative Council

Viney P. Aneja, Ph.D.  
Professor Air Quality  
Professor Environmental Technology  
North Carolina State University

Henry W. Art, Ph.D.  
Samuel Fessenden Professor of Biology  
Williams College

Loretta Battaglia, Ph.D.  
Secretary General, Society of Wetland Scientists  
Associate Professor of Wetland Ecology  
Southern Illinois University

Matthew Berman, Ph.D.  
Professor of Economics  
University of Alaska Anchorage

Mary S. Booth, Ph.D.  
Director  
Partnership for Policy Integrity

Mark Bradford, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor of Terrestrial Ecosystem  
Ecology  
Yale University

Jonah Busch, Ph.D.  
Senior Fellow, Center for Global Development  
Washington, DC.

Robert Cabin, Ph.D.  
Professor of Ecology and Environmental Science  
Brevard College

Ken Caldeira, Ph.D.  
Senior Scientist  
Department of Global Ecology  
Carnegie Institution for Science

Julia Cherry, Ph.D.  
Treasurer, Society of Wetland Scientists  
Associate Professor of Interdisciplinary Sciences  
and Wetland Ecology  
University of Alabama

Eric Chivian, M.D.  
Founder and Former Director  
The Center for Health and the Global  
Environment  
Harvard Medical School

Norm L. Christensen, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus and Founding Dean  
Nicholas School of the Environment  
Duke University

James Clark, Ph.D.  
Nicholas School of the Environment  
Duke University

Steve Colt, Ph.D.  
Professor of Economics  
University of Alaska Anchorage

Jeffrey Corbin, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
Union College

Gretchen C. Daily, Ph. D.  
Bing Professor of Environmental Science  
Stanford University

Eric A. Davidson, Ph.D.  
Professor and Director Appalachian Laboratory  
University of Maryland Center for  
Environmental Science

Gillian T. Davies, M.E.S., PWS,  
Registered Soil Scientist, NHCWS  
President Elect, Society of Wetland Scientists

Steven J. Davis, Ph.D.  
Assistant Professor  
Dept. of Earth System Science  
University of California, Irvine

David Dethier, Ph.D.  
Edward Brust Professor of Geology and  
Mineralogy  
Department of Geosciences  
Williams College

Saara J. DeWalt, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
Clemson University

Aaron M. Ellison, Ph.D.  
Senior Research Fellow in Ecology, Harvard  
Forest  
Harvard University

David Foster, Ph.D.  
Director, Harvard Forest  
Harvard University

Andrew J. Friedland, Ph.D.  
Richard and Jane Pearl Professor of  
Environmental Studies  
Adjunct Professor of Biological Sciences and  
Earth Sciences  
Dartmouth College

Peter Frumhoff, Ph.D.  
Director of Science and Policy  
Union of Concerned Scientists

Paul W. Gabrielson, Ph.D.  
President, Phycological Society of America  
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Biology  
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

James Galloway, Ph.D.  
Sidman P. Poole Professor  
Department of Environmental Sciences  
University of Virginia

Andrew George, Ph.D.  
Community Engagement Research Associate  
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Scott Goetz, Ph.D.  
Deputy Director and Senior Scientist  
Woods Hole Research Center

Matthew C. Hansen, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Department of Geographical Sciences  
University of Maryland

Mark E. Harmon, Ph.D.  
Richardson Chair and Professor  
Oregon State University

John Harte, Ph.D.  
Professor of Ecosystem Sciences  
ERG/ESPM  
University of California at Berkeley

Sarah Hobbie, Ph.D.  
Professor, Department of Ecology, Evolution  
and Behavior  
University of Minnesota

R. Max Holmes, Ph.D.  
Senior Scientist  
Woods Hole Research Center  
Richard A. Houghton, Ph.D.  
Senior Scientist and George M. Woodwell Chair  
for Global Ecology  
Woods Hole Research Center

Richard A. Houghton, Ph.D.  
Senior Scientist,  
George M. Woodwell Chair for Global Ecology  
Woods Hole Research Center

Robert W. Howarth, Ph.D.  
David R. Atkinson Professor of Ecology  
and Environmental Biology  
Cornell University  
Editor-in-Chief, Limnology & Oceanography  
Founding Editor, Biogeochemistry

Robert M. Hughes,  
President, International Fisheries Section  
American Fisheries Society

Malcolm L. Hunter, Jr, Ph.D.  
Professor of Wildlife Ecology  
Libra Professor of Conservation Biology  
University of Maine, Orono

Deborah Lawrence, PhD  
Environmental Sciences  
University of Virginia

John Lichter, Ph.D.  
Professor of Biology and Environmental Studies  
Bowdoin College

Gene E. Likens, Ph.D.  
Distinguished Research Professor  
University of Connecticut  
Special Advisor to the University President on  
Environmental Affairs  
Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies  
Founding Director and President Emeritus

Thomas Lovejoy, Ph.D.  
Senior Fellow, United Nations Foundation  
Professor, Environmental Science and Policy  
George Mason University

Richard N. Mack, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
School of Biological Sciences  
Washington State University

James McCarthy, Ph.D.  
Alexander Agassiz Professor of Biological  
Oceanography  
Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences and  
Department of Organismic and Evolutionary  
Biology  
Harvard University

Jerry Melillo, PhD  
Distinguished Scientist  
The Ecosystems Center  
Marine Biological laboratory

Jacqueline Mohan, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
Terrestrial Ecosystem Ecology &  
Biogeochemistry  
University of Georgia

Susan Natali, Ph.D.  
Associate Scientist  
Woods Hole Research Center

Neil Pederson, Ph.D.  
Senior Ecologist, Harvard Forest  
Harvard University

James E. Perry, Ph.D., PWS  
Immediate Past President, Society of Wetland  
Scientists  
Professor of Marine Science  
Virginia Institute of Marine Science  
College of William and Mary

Kimberli J. Ponzio, M.S., PWS  
President, Society of Wetland Scientists

Jennifer Powers, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
Dept. of Ecology, Evolution, and Behavior  
University of Minnesota

G. Philip Robertson, Ph.D.  
University Distinguished Professor  
Dept. of Plant, Soil, and Microbial Sciences  
Michigan State University

Jonathan Sanderman, Ph.D.  
Associate Scientist  
Woods Hole Research Center

Timothy D. Searchinger, J.D.  
Research Scholar  
Woodrow Wilson School  
Science, Technology and Environmental  
program  
Princeton University

Herman H. Shugart, Ph.D.  
W.W. Corcoran Professor  
Department of Environmental Sciences  
University of Virginia

Miles Silman, Ph.D.  
Andrew Sabin Professor of Conservation  
Biology  
Wake Forest University

James R. Strittholt, Ph.D.  
President/Executive Director  
Conservation Biology Institute

Richard Thomas, Ph.D.  
Professor and Chair of Biology  
West Virginia University  
Richard H. Waring, Ph.D.  
O.S.U. Distinguished Professor Emeritus of  
Forest Ecosystems  
Oregon State University

Alan S. Weakley, Ph.D.  
Adjunct Associate Professor  
Director, UNC Herbarium

Matt R. Whiles, Ph.D.  
Professor of Zoology  
President, Society for Freshwater Science  
Director, SIU Center for Ecology  
Interim Director, Cooperative Wildlife Research  
Laboratory  
Southern Illinois University

Herb Wilson, Ph.D.  
Arey Professor of the Biosciences  
Department of Biology  
Colby College

George M. Woodwell, Ph.D.  
Founder  
Woods Hole Research Center

### Societies

Phycological Society of America  
Paul W. Gabrielson, Ph.D., President

Society of Wetland Scientists,  
Kimberli J. Ponzio, M.S., PWS, President

Society for Freshwater Science  
Matt R. Whiles, Ph.D., President